

Literature Review II



MASSEY UNIVERSITY


Dr Julia Rayner
Centre for Teaching and Learning

An examination of the key research on a topic

Involves:

- The **selection** of available documents on the topic, which contain ideas, data and evidence
- The **synthesis** of information into a coherent “story” of knowledge on the topic
- The **effective evaluation** of these documents in relation to [your research]


(Hart, 1998; Davidson & Tollich, 1999)



MASSEY UNIVERSITY


Tips on paraphrasing/summarising

- Always indicate whose ideas they are by introducing them e.g according to Smith (1999) and use different verbs in different places
- Look for main ideas/key features, rather than just words
- Repackage the idea e.g this concept is explained by, the issue focuses on, this means
- Read, understand and build up a picture then rely on your memory
- Check what you have written against the source, modify it if it is too similar




MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Using the literature to take a position




- Quoting
- Paraphrasing
- <http://owll.massey.ac.nz/>



MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Examples of arguments


- **Assertion**
 - Schooling in the nation’s largest national professional activity
- **Evidence**
 - Budget + \$25 billion, 300000 employees, 9,600 sites, 3.25 million clients



MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Argument?

- Bilingualism and multilingualism confer many benefits. Speakers of more than one language have a better understanding of how languages are structured because they can compare across two different systems. People who speak only one language lack this essential point of reference. In many cases a second language can help people to have a better understanding and appreciation of their first language



MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Argument?

- Complementary therapies are an increasingly popular supplement to other forms of treatment. Those who use these therapies argue that treatments such as reflexology, homeopathy and shiatsu complement the care provided by the medical profession. Indeed, some people claim that these therapies are more effective than traditional medicines. Anecdotal cases of miraculous cures abound and there are those who believe such methods can compete on equal terms with medical approaches. This just isn't convincing.

History: education

Toi Kōwhiri
Te Pūkenga
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Argument?

People are less politically aware now than they have been at any time in the past. For hundreds of years, people took great personal risks to fight for causes that would benefit other people more than themselves. This rarely happens today. As late as the 1980s, there were frequent rallies with people in one country demonstrating to show solidarity with people elsewhere. Now rallies are more likely to be for personal gain such as better salaries or student grants rather than for political issues of wider application. Even low risk activities such as voting in elections attract low turn-outs.

History: education

Toi Kōwhiri
Te Pūkenga
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Argument?

Recently, Ice Age specialists were excited to find evidence of some cultural links between Ice Age peoples across Europe. On a return visit to Cresswell Crags in England, they found images of horses, bison, and red deer similar to those already found in Germany. There is much controversy about other figures found on cave walls, which some experts believe to be images of dancing women, whereas others remain unconvinced.

History: education

Toi Kōwhiri
Te Pūkenga
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Argument?

The bas relief images of horses, bison and red deer found in Cresswell Crags, England, bear remarkable similarities to those found in Germany. It is unlikely that two separate cultures would have produced drawings of such similarity if there were not links between them. This suggests that there were greater cultural links between continental Europe and Britain during the Ice Age than was formerly believed.

Task 1

History: education

Toi Kōwhiri
Te Pūkenga
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Reading Critically Actively Engage with Material

Step 1: Check for Relevance & Reliability -

Topic/Focus?

- check abstract, introduction, conclusion

Current?

- most recent research leads to previous work
- most up-to-date statistics and data

Reliable?

- academic source?
- author bias?
- evidence from where?

History: education

Toi Kōwhiri
Te Pūkenga
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Critical analysis

The text

- **Background:**
- **Purpose:** (claim/conclusion)
- **Evidence:** points to develop it/evidence to support points and quality of this evidence
- **Logical connections between claim and evidence:**
- **Methodology:** sample size/selection/controls/confounding variables/alternative methodologies
- **Balance:**
- **Limitations:**
- **Applications/implications:**

Task 2

History: education

Toi Kōwhiri
Te Pūkenga
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Another example

- Bullying is on the rise. Research conducted 1993, 14 mentions of word 'bullying', 2003 there were 160 referrals.
 - More awareness
 - More concerns so more funding to research
 - Hot topic
 - Proportional in terms of research

– **Task 1**
(Denholm & Evans, 2006)

Research articulating

Ti Kōwhiri
ki Pōwhiri
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Critiquing existing research in relation to your topic

- | | | |
|---------------------------|---|---------------------------------------|
| <i>Who did the study?</i> | <i>What did the researchers do? Be appropriately specific</i> | <i>What did the researchers find?</i> |
| <i>When was it done?</i> | | |
| <i>Why was it done?</i> | | |

Smith and Jones (2004) analysed the content of advertisements on New Zealand television during a one week period between the hours of 3pm to 6pm, with the intention of examining the nutritional quality of food in television food advertisements targeted at children. They found that the majority of the food advertisements analysed were for foods that were high in fat, sugars and sodium.

↑
Description only

Move beyond description into analysis and critique

Critiquing existing research in relation to your topic

Smith and Jones (2004) analysed the content of advertisements on New Zealand television during a two year period between the hours of 3pm to 6pm each day, with the intention of examining the nutritional quality of food in television food advertisements targeted at children. They found that the majority of the food advertisements analysed were for foods that were high in fat, sugars and sodium. The study provides a basis for comparing advertising patterns over time. **Contribution**

However it does not include any discussion of eating situations or eating behaviour as shown in the advertisements. **Limitation**

- Identify strengths and limitations in relation to your research
- You're constructing an argument about gaps in current knowledge - **your voice must come through clearly in the review TASK 2/3**

Research articulating

Ti Kōwhiri
ki Pōwhiri
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Use of appropriate verbs in citations

- Smith (2000) **suggests that** happiness is strongly correlated with sense of community
- Tipper (1999) **stresses** the importance of understanding customs
- While the 'integration' theory **has been rejected** (Davies, 2003) the self-fulfilment idea has wide-spread **support** (Dean, 2000; Tomas, 2002)
- Jones' study **assumes** that all participants have a similar educational background
- Del (2005) **acknowledges that** the small sample size used may not be representative of the population as a whole

Research articulating

Ti Kōwhiri
ki Pōwhiri
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Using critics

- As a support
- Disagreeing with critics
- As a 'springboard'
- As a 'sounding board'

(Marggraf Turley, 2000)

Ti Kōwhiri
ki Pōwhiri
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

As support

- The impact of text messaging on communication, is only just becoming apparent. As James (2007) points out, "the average person in USA sends 2000 texts every

(Marggraf Turley, 2000)

Research articulating

Ti Kōwhiri
ki Pōwhiri
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Disagreeing with critics

- In his recent article “A Bilingual Education” Dobbs fails to consider the home as a place where the language is promoted and developed. This environment is critical in motivating the mastery of

(Marggraf Turley, 2000)

Research & Learning

To Knowledge
In Practice
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Your voice

- Snake’s suggestion that “school management ... could be outsourced” is at best misguided.
- The notion of a tax that reflects the number of people in a household could hardly be regarded as fair. As Fair (1998, p.23) pointed out “one could hardly charge a low income family with 6 children 6 times that of an individual living alone in the rich suburbs of London.”
- The idea that children have high awareness and recall of cigarette advertising is not new. Smith (2000) reported Similarly, Thoms (2001) observed

Research & Learning

To Knowledge
In Practice
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

As a ‘springboard’

- Management theorists hailing the notion of expectancy in achieving sales outcomes (Malcolm, 2005; Siims, 2006) raises interests in its application in the arena of education, especially in the current climate’s focus on learning outcomes.

(Marggraf Turley, 2000)

Research & Learning

To Knowledge
In Practice
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

As a ‘sounding board’

- It could even be that, as a whole, Bronte’s *Wuthering Heights* constitutes a concerted investigation into ‘learned’ cruelty in the family. However, Theiling, in his book *Violence and the Victorian Novel*, claims that cruelty in *Wuthering Heights* is random with no meaning attached. However, this seems to underplay the purposeful cruelty seen throughout the novel. Indeed, Davies in *Bronte’s passion* suggests that it is a premeditated

(Marggraf Turley, 2000)

Research & Learning

To Knowledge
In Practice
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Synthesise information on existing research on the topic

- **Where is your voice here?** What is the point you’re making about the topic in this paragraph? Which issue does the research highlight?

Research by Brown (2002)

- **Where is your voice here?** What is the relationship between Brown’s research and Smith’s research?

Research by Smith (2005)

- **Where is your voice here?** What is the relationship between Atken’s research and that of Brown and of Smith?

Research by Atken (2007)

How are all these linked to your research question?

Research & Learning

To Knowledge
In Practice
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

The donut and swiss roll effect



- (Blaxter, Hughes & Tight, 2000)

Research & Learning

To Knowledge
In Practice
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Synthesise information from your

SOURCES Caulley (1992) notes that a literature review should:

- Compare and contrast different authors' views on an issue (areas of consensus/divergence)

Identify areas of consensus: *Many findings support Toll's disengagement theory (Peters, 2003; Han, 2004; Smith, 2006; West, 2008).*

Identify areas of divergence: *Much debate exists on the issue of... Smith (1999) claims In contrast, Jones (2000) argues ...*

Highlight exemplary studies/seminal ideas (referring to original author where possible),

An important language switching study and particularly relevant to this thesis was carried out by .../ Einstein's (1923) theory of relativity

- Highlight gaps in research,

The above studies have all demonstrated switching costs. However, none of them have attempted to explain the costs in terms of how the ..

(as cited in The University of Melbourne, 2006, Getting started)

Research articulating

Te Kōwhiri
i te Pūwhiri
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Synthesise information on existing research

2. Restrictions on tobacco advertising

2.1. Tobacco advertising and smoking initiation **Topic sentence – make a point**

Several studies have shown that children are aware of cigarette advertisements and that they remember specific advertising manifestations (DiFranza et al., 1991; Nelson and White, 1992; Hastings et al., 1994; Altman et al., 1996), even children aged under 6 years (Fischer et al., 1991). For example, Hastings et al. (1994) showed that a campaign to promote Imperial Tobacco's "Regal" brand in the U.K. was getting through to children more effectively than it was to adults. It held much more appeal for teenagers than for adults. This study contributed to Imperial Tobacco being forced to withdraw this advertising campaign.

Your voice must guide the discussion

Research articulating

Te Kōwhiri
i te Pūwhiri
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Citing research

- Many attempts have been made to explain the increased incidence of divorce in New Zealand. Although both Taylor (2008) and Jones (2009) find explanations in the legal system Taylor focuses more on the changes in law rather whereas Jones argues that people today are more aware of their rights. These viewpoints do not, however, seem to address the relationship itself. Son (2009) attempts to do this by looking at the increase in reported domestic abuse cases. This is problematic though, as Jerry (2009) points out, this may not reflect actual increases so much as willingness to seek help.

- (Adapted from Monash University, 2009)

- Task 4

Research articulating

Te Kōwhiri
i te Pūwhiri
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

In summary: A critical review of the literature...

- Involves synthesising and critiquing existing knowledge on your topic
 1. Making sure your voice is heard
 2. Bringing together commonalities and highlighting differences

(Hart, 1998; Davidson & Tollich, 1999)

Research articulating

Te Kōwhiri
i te Pūwhiri
MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Recommended sources

Emerson, L. (Ed.) (2005). *Writing guidelines for business students*. (3rd ed.) Southbank, Victoria, Australia: Thomson Dunmore Press.

Emerson, L. & Hampton, J. (Eds.) (2005). *Writing guidelines for science and applied science students* (2nd ed.). Southbank, Victoria, Australia: Thomson Dunmore Press.

Emerson, L. (Ed.) (2005) *Writing guidelines for social science students* (3rd ed.). Southbank, Victoria, Australia: Thomson Dunmore Press.

Hart, C. (1998). *Doing a literature review*. London: Sage Publications.

Marggraf Turley, R. (2000). *Writing essays. A guide for Students in English and Humanities*. London, Routledge Falmer

Ridley, D. (2008). *The literature review*. London: Sage Publications

Rountree, K. (1996). *Writing by degrees. A practical guide to writing theses and research papers*. Auckland: Longman.

Swales, J.M., & Feak, C.B. (1994). *Academic writing for graduate students*. Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan Press.

Research articulating

Te Kōwhiri
i te Pūwhiri
MASSEY UNIVERSITY